

# **EXHIBIT B**

## THE CORONAVIRUS PANDEMIC

# A scientist finds celebrity in the anti-vax movement

BY TIMOTHY BELLA

As Robert Malone stood on the steps of the Lincoln Memorial before thousands of anti-vaccine and anti-maskers gathered Sunday, the medical doctor and infectious-disease researcher repeated the falsehoods that have garnered him legions of followers.

"Regarding the genetic covid vaccines, the scientist who helped us said in his 15-minute speech that referenced the Rev. Martin Luther King Jr. and John F. Kennedy, 'They are not working.'

The misinformation came two days after the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention released its first study, based on a world of data showing that coronavirus vaccines provide strong protection against hospitalization from the rapidly spreading omicron variant.

Malone, who said the coronavirus "should never have been politicized," was met with roaring applause.

"You tell 'em, doc!" one man shouted.

Malone, who bills himself as having played a key role in the creation of mRNA vaccines, has emerged as one of the most controversial voices of the movement against the science, vaccination and health mandates. His claims and suggestions have been discredited and denounced by medical professionals as not only wrong but also dangerous. Twitter barred him for violating the platform's coronavirus misinformation policy. He has been booted from platforms elsewhere — recently appearing on an episode of Joe Rogan's wildly popular podcast, which averages 11 million listeners per episode.

That show — along with guest spots on Fox News programming hosted by Tucker Carlson and Laura Ingraham — thrust the 62-year-old into the limelight at a crucial time of the pandemic, when unvaccinated patients continue to fill ICU wards.

Critics say Malone's story highlights the peril of offering a platform to anyone who, once claiming to be "writing out of history" and now finding celebrity.

"There is a huge market for misinformation," said Jay Van Bavel, an assistant professor of psychology and neural science at New York University and a student of cognitive therapies and misinformation. "The way he's framed in the conspiracy-theory world is that he's a courageous whistleblower rather than someone who is spreading misinformation — and it's only enhancing his profile."

A former colleague of Malone's, who spoke on the condition of anonymity to speak candidly without fear of retribution, said that while Malone is "a brilliant scientist who has a tremendous amount of experience and knowledge about vaccines," there is reason to be worried about how his personal standstill could be a public health risk.

"I don't feel what he's doing and saying is in the right context or necessarily very helpful," the former co-worker said. "Everyone is entitled to their opinion, but they're not all facing what he's not accurately representing the information."

Malone had a following before his "Joe Rogan Experience" interview that was released Dec. 31 — but that showed him to an even wider audience. In it, he promoted an unfounded theory called "mass-formation psych-



Robert Malone, who bills himself as having played a key role in the creation of mRNA vaccines, speaks Sunday at a rally in D.C. following a march in opposition to coronavirus-related mandates. The medical doctor has claimed coronavirus vaccines "are not working."

TOM BRENNER/REUTERS

sis," telling Rogan that a "third of the population [is] basically being targeted" and implying that what the mainstream media and Anthony S. Fauci, the nation's top infectious-disease expert and chief medical adviser to President Biden, report on the vaccines, Malone went on to compare the country's pandemic policies to Nazi Germany.

His remarks drew massive attention — and outrage. "To claim that choosing not to get a vaccine and not being able to go to a movie theater is in any way comparable to Jewish people being targeted and murdered, it blows my mind," said Jennifer Linton, an assistant professor of medicine at the University of Manitoba who signed a letter from 270 medical professionals to Spotify this month demanding that the company do more to prevent the spread of false covid-19 information and to denounce the impact of the Holocaust."

Van Bavel added: "He used a pseudoscience term and millions of people downloaded the episode — and it took on a life of its own, even though there is no evidence supporting it."

Malone declined to be interviewed, but a source said he "would not be able to support" The Washington Post's request. He did not provide further explanation. Neither Rogan's publicist nor a Spotify spokesperson immediately replied to requests for comment. A Fox News spokesperson did not respond to a request for comment.

A person who has stood by Malone since he first spoke to Rogan, Robert F. Kennedy Jr., a longtime anti-vaccine activist who also spoke at Sunday's march, in a statement to The Post, Kennedy defended media reports on Malone promoting misinformation as a "coup d'etat" for an assertion that departs from government orthodoxy on the variants of people worldwide, according to Nature.

Malone has been public about saying his early work on mRNA vaccines has been overlooked in favor of those who have been declared mRNA pioneers for working on later advancements. Even though two of his papers were the first reference in a 2019 paper about the history of mRNA vaccines, Malone told Rogan, "I've been written out of history."

One of those people who has received recognition for work in mRNA vaccines is biochemist Katalin Karikó, who the New York Times said was among the many who "helped shield the world from the pandemic." Karikó shared with the Atlantic an email Malone sent her that accused the biochemist of inflating her accomplishments: "This is not going to end well!" Malone told the magazine in August that the message was not meant as a threat. Karikó declined to comment.

Like anything else in life, it can be a bit of a stretch," the former colleague said. "But that can be untrue."

Malone has long billed himself as the inventor of mRNA vaccines, but the history behind the development is more complicated. When he was a graduate student at the Salk Institute for Biological Sciences in San Diego in the late 1980s, Malone injected DNA and RNA into mice cells. He co-wrote papers in 1989 and 1990 that said such an injection of fatty droplets into a living organism could bring about new proteins — possibly creating the first alternative approaches to vaccine development for human cells, researchers wrote.

Nature magazine reported that Malone's experiments drew on the work of other researchers, and dozens of companies and academics would later follow into his lead, blocking the way for mRNA vaccines. Malone's work offered some of the stepping-stones toward decades of innovations from hundreds of researchers that would eventually give way to the mRNA-based coronavirus vaccines administered to millions of people worldwide, according to Nature.

Malone has been public about getting vaccinated, which he hoped would alleviate the long-term symptoms he suffered. But he told the Atlantic that the Moderna injections made his symptoms worse, echoing similar claims from mandate opponents such as musician Eric Clapton. Since then, Malone's objections to requiring the Pfizer-BioNTech and Moderna vaccines has been mostly about the expedited approval process, as well as the government's system to track adverse reactions from those who have been vaccinated.

He published his criticisms of the vaccines and mandates on Twitter, building a following of more than 440,000 users — and a reach that extended far beyond the platform. At an Ohio school board meeting in August, a man who introduced himself as a doctor shared several misleading claims about the vaccines, including that they were not safe and should never take the vaccines.

While skeptical of the shots, Malone told the AP in August that he had never stated that coronavirus vaccines should not be administered. His comments have shifted against vaccines more in recent days, however, as he argued that the variants are destroying the approved narrative that the vaccines are safe and effective," ignoring last week's CDC notice that vaccine boosters were preventing serious illness from the omicron variant of the coronavirus, which causes the disease. Malone told the AP that he wanted people to get vaccinated, but that he didn't believe the drug to treat my own case."

Trump's administration funded a \$21 million study of fatigued in April 2020 that was to be done by Alchem and Northwell Health, a New York health care provider, despite a lack of data or published studies showing it could be effective against the virus. Malone, who had lobbied the company to get the contract, complained to the Associated Press of a difficult work environment. The study eventually fizzled out amid allegations of conflicts of interest and scientific misconduct. Officials with Alchem and Northwell declined comment.

Malone said he hoped that getting vaccinated would alleviate the long-term symptoms he suffered. But he told the Atlantic that the Moderna injections made his symptoms worse, echoing similar claims from mandate opponents such as musician Eric

policy at the University of Alberta, said Malone injecting himself into a conversation with the kind of credentials he has, and "cherry-picking rotten data," was "a weird way to do science."

"You have this individual who has all these credentials and this history in the biomedical world, so that looks impressive. And he's referencing a study that, on the face of it, may look impressive. But you don't realize that the study is 'fraudulent,'" Caulfield said, adding that Malone has "weakened bad research."

In November, Malone shared a deceptive video to his Twitter followers that falsely linked athlete deaths to coronavirus shots. The video, which claimed the virus vaccination killed Jake West, a 17-year-old Indiana high school football player who died of sudden cardiac arrest. But the vaccine played no role in West's death. The teen died of an undiagnosed heart condition in 2013.

Malone has also been sharing these words about vaccination: "Safe and effective?" He deleted the tweet about the same time he received a cease-and-desist letter from West's family, according to the AP, and later noted to his followers that he didn't know the video had been "doctored."

Twitter suspended Malone's account in December; the next day, Rogan published his interview with Malone that pushed the vaccine scientist to stardom.

Rogan's episode drew immediate backlash, but Malone found support from Rep. Troy Nehls (R-Tex.) and fellow Republicans in the House who called for a full transcript of the interview into the Congressional Record. At Sunday's march, there were numerous Malone followers in the audience, including Rachel Giltz, who carried a sign reading, "Do you have mass-founding psychosis?"

"It seems like a lot of people saw his side of this issue for the first time when he did his interview with Joe Rogan," said Giltz, 31, of Richmond. "It definitely seems like he's made a big impact."

Critics such as Laxton are frustrated with how Malone has been embraced as a credible ally: "He's put himself exactly where he wants to be. I don't think you're going to dissuade too many people from not following him."

Daniel Gitterman, 52, a father of two with his two young children to attend Sunday's march, said Malone's interview with Rogan, as well as his credentials, have "galvanized" parents who are against vaccinating their children.

"Dr. Malone has risked his reputation to become an icon of what's right and true," he said, adding that he doesn't believe Malone was promoting misinformation. "Everything he does is done in the best interest for people as a whole."

After Malone concluded his speech, a young parent who had come to the rally to denounce his misinformation, "Thank you!"

With his increased profile in recent weeks, a step back and reflect on the damage his misinformation is causing.

"Given the polarization that exists in our world, I don't think what he's doing is helping," said Malone's former colleague. "That's what I would ask him right now: 'Do you think this is helping?'"

timothy.bella@washpost.com

sweater or tank top?

Stay one step ahead of the weather with the Capital Weather Gang

washingtonpost.com/news/capital-weather-gang

@capitalweather